

FIELD EXPERIMENTS AND THEIR CRITICS

Essays on the Uses
and Abuses of
Experimentation in
the Social Sciences

Edited by
Dawn Langan Teele

Yale UNIVERSITY PRESS
New Haven & London

Copyright © 2014 by Yale University.

All rights reserved.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, including illustrations, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law and except by reviewers for the public press), without written permission from the publishers.

Yale University Press books may be purchased in quantity for educational, business, or promotional use. For information, please e-mail sales.press@yale.edu (U.S. office) or sales@yaleup.co.uk (U.K. office).

Set in Galliard and Copperplate 33 types by Newgen North America.
Printed in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Field experiments and their critics : essays on the uses and abuses of experimentation in the social sciences / edited by Dawn Langan Teele.

pages cm. — (The Yale ISPS series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-300-16940-9 (alk. paper)

1. Social sciences—Research—Methodology. I. Teele, Dawn Langan, 1983–

H62.F4195 2013

300.72—dc23

2013007487

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/NISO Z39.48–1992
(Permanence of Paper).

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

CONTENTS

Preface vii

Introduction 1

DAWN LANGAN TEELE

1. The Illusion of Learning from Observational Research 9

ALAN S. GERBER, DONALD P. GREEN, AND EDWARD H. KAPLAN

2. A Defense of Observational Research 33

SUSAN C. STOKES

**3. A Retreat from Radical Skepticism: Rebalancing Theory,
Observational Data, and Randomization in Development
Economics 58**

CHRISTOPHER B. BARRETT AND MICHAEL R. CARTER

4. The Experimental Approach to Development Economics 78

ABHIJIT V. BANERJEE AND ESTHER DUFLO

5. Reflections on the Ethics of Field Experiments 115

DAWN LANGAN TEELE

**6. Instruments, Randomization, and Learning About
Development 141**

ANGUS DEATON

VI CONTENTS

7. Experimental Reasoning in Social Science	185
ANDREW GELMAN	
8. Misunderstandings Between Experimentalists and Observationalists About Causal Inference	196
KOSUKE IMAI, GARY KING, AND ELIZABETH A. STUART	
9. Methods Are Like People: If You Focus Only on What They Can't Do, You Will Always Be Disappointed	228
IAN SHAPIRO	
References 243	
Contributors 267	
Index 269	